



**ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS**  
**GREG ABBOTT**

July 20, 2004

Mr. Mark G. Mann  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Garland  
P.O. Box 469002  
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2004-5997

Dear Mr. Mann:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 205386.

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified arrest. You state that some of the requested information has been released to the requestor. You claim that portions of the remaining requested information are excepted from disclosure pursuant to sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and have reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the submitted information contains a social security number that may be excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I).<sup>1</sup> These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). The department has cited no law, nor are we aware

---

<sup>1</sup> Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information that is protected from disclosure by other statutes.

of any law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990, that authorizes it to obtain or maintain social security numbers. Thus, we have no basis for concluding that this social security number is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I) of title 42 of the United States Code. We caution the department, however, that section 552.352 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing this social security number, the department should ensure that it was not obtained and is not maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In addition, we note that criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Further, when a governmental entity compiles information that relates to a specific individual as a criminal suspect, arrestee, or defendant, the compiled information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right of privacy in a manner that the same information in an uncompiled state does not.<sup>2</sup> *See United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 616 at 2-3 (1993). Accordingly, we conclude that to the extent that the requested information contains any CHRI that is confidential under federal law, chapter 411 of the Government Code, or the common-law right to privacy on the basis of *Reporters Committee*, the department must withhold such information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You claim that the portions of the submitted information which you highlighted in yellow are excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) provides that information held by a law enforcement agency or

---

<sup>2</sup> Section 552.101 also encompasses information that is protected from disclosure by the common-law right to privacy.

prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from disclosure if "release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) as an exception to disclosure must demonstrate how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the submitted information is associated with a case that is currently pending prosecution with the Dallas County District Attorney's Office. Thus, based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this information. Accordingly, we conclude that the department may withhold the information that you have highlighted in yellow pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Finally, you claim that the portions of the submitted information which you highlighted in green are excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information that relates to: "(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state; or (3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document." Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(3). Accordingly, we conclude that the department must withhold the portions of the submitted information, which you highlighted in green, pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, a social security number contained within the submitted information may be confidential under federal law. To the extent that the requested information contains any CHRI that is confidential under federal law, chapter 411 of the Government Code, or the common-law right to privacy on the basis of *Reporters Committee*, the department must withhold such information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the information that you have highlighted in yellow pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the portions of the submitted information, which you highlighted in green, pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days.

*Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Ronald J. Bounds  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RJB/jh

Ref: ID# 205386

Enc. Marked documents

c: Ms. Dorothy Powers  
10829 Estacado  
Dallas, Texas 75228  
(w/o enclosures)